The Vulnerability Report

Human Trafficking in the Greater Mekong Sub-region

A study of migration-related knowledge and behaviours to inform World Vision’s ‘End Trafficking in Persons’ Program
This report presents the main findings of a study carried out in the countries participating in World Vision’s End Trafficking in Persons Project: Cambodia, China, Laos, Myanmar, Thailand and Vietnam. It was designed and coordinated by World Vision Australia and World Vision East Asia Regional Office. National level assessments were carried out by project staff in each country as well as a consultant. We would specifically like to acknowledge the contribution of the Regional Program Manager, John Whan Yoon and the country teams. We are very grateful for the invaluable contributions of World Vision Australia, particularly Emma Pritchard and Nami Kurimoto, as well as Meagan Price, Annabel Hart, Kate Horwood, Melissa Stewart and Julie Smith. Special thanks to our Technical Advisors: Dr. Cathy Zimmerman and Dr. Ligia Kiss, Gender Violence and Health Centre, London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine.

Except as acknowledged by the references in this document to other authors and publications, the information described herein consists of World Vision’s own work and the communities where the survey took place. Any associated intellectual property rests with World Vision Australia.

The images of children used in these education materials are for illustrative purposes only and, to World Vision’s knowledge, do not portray actual victims of trafficking in persons. World Vision complies with child protection standards in taking photographs of children. All images were taken by World Vision staff.
Overview

This report presents an overview of the findings of an extensive regional study conducted by World Vision in communities in Cambodia, Laos, Myanmar, Thailand, and Vietnam on knowledge, attitudes and practices related to trafficking in persons, with a specific focus on the vulnerability of migrant populations.

The study was undertaken to inform the monitoring and evaluation of World Vision’s “End Trafficking in Persons” (ETIP) program, a regional initiative designed to prevent and respond to trafficking in persons in the Greater Mekong Subregion. It assessed migration-related knowledge, attitudes and behaviours of young people and their primary female caregivers, and surveyed the knowledge, attitudes and behaviours of Thai people toward migrants in areas with high migrant populations. On the basis of the results, we make recommendations for actions that could reduce the vulnerability of young people to trafficking.

The primary purpose of the study was to inform World Vision’s efforts to reduce the vulnerability of certain populations. Yet given the breadth of the study (close to 10,000 respondents across five countries) and the dearth of available evidence on vulnerability to trafficking, the findings may also be of interest to others combating trafficking in persons regarding safe migration, trafficking, child protection and child rights; and, attitudes and behaviours of host communities in Thailand regarding migrant workers.

Each of these factors may contribute to a child and youth’s vulnerability and hence increased risk to trafficking, or they may be protective and hence contribute to reducing risk to trafficking.

Background

The Greater Mekong Sub-region (GMS) is made up of six countries connected by the Mekong River: Cambodia, China, Laos, Myanmar, Thailand and Vietnam. With limited opportunities for safe and legal migration in the GMS, irregular migration is widespread, creating opportunities for the trafficking and exploitation of migrants. Human trafficking is a serious crime that affects men, women, youth and children around the world. It involves putting or keeping someone in an exploitative situation, usually for profit. While the full scale of human trafficking is difficult to ascertain due to the illegal and often undetected nature of the crime, there is substantial evidence that children, youth and adults from the GMS can find themselves in diverse forms of trafficking both in their own and other countries, including forced or bonded labour, child labour, sexual exploitation, domestic servitude or forced marriage.

Since 2005, World Vision has been addressing human trafficking in the GMS through regional anti-trafficking projects. World Vision’s End Trafficking in Persons (ETIP) Program is a regional anti-trafficking program working across the six countries of the GMS - Cambodia, China, Laos, Myanmar, Thailand, and Vietnam, from 2011-2016.

ETIP is World Vision’s largest anti-trafficking program and consists of three projects that work together in three key ways:

- **Prevention:** empowering vulnerable communities to reduce the risk of trafficking
- **Protection:** strengthening protection services and empowering human trafficking survivors
- **Policy:** creating a collaborative environment and using field-based evidence to strengthen policies related to human trafficking, creating lasting change

ETIP works in both ‘source’ communities from which migrants originate and are considered vulnerable to trafficking, and in ‘destination’ communities where migrants travel to and where exploitation may take place. In addition, ETIP works closely with law enforcement agencies and other stakeholders in the identification and protection of trafficking victims.

Objectives

This study was designed to collect data to test the ETIP program’s theory of change and provide information to guide future anti-trafficking programming.

Specifically, the key objectives of the study were to ascertain:

- Current knowledge levels, prevalent attitudes and behaviours among parents/caregivers, regarding safe migration, trafficking, child protection and child rights;
- Current knowledge levels, prevalent attitudes and behaviours among children and youth regarding safe migration, trafficking, child protection and child rights; and,
- Attitudes and behaviours of host communities in Thailand regarding migrant workers.

1 An Assessment was also conducted in China and a country level report completed, but a different methodology was used as the data was not comparable and has not been presented in this report.

2 ETIP is primarily funded by World Vision Australia, with the support of the Australian Government. It is also supported by World Vision Canada, Japan, Korea, Taiwan and United States.
Methods

This study used a community cross-sectional survey design to examine knowledge, attitudes, behaviours and environment factors (of young people, female caregivers and host communities) that the project’s theory of change posits affect a young person’s vulnerability to trafficking. Questionnaires were developed drawing upon similar questionnaires conducted in the region and World Vision’s standard measurement tools and were translated into local languages. Informed consent was obtained from all study participants.

Three questionnaires were used:

In “source” countries (Cambodia, Laos, Myanmar, Vietnam) two questionnaires were used:

• The Mother/female caregiver questionnaire was administered to one woman per household. This questionnaire explored attitudes towards children and youth migrating for work; knowledge of child rights, human trafficking, and migration practices; experiences of migration for work; household composition; and family well-being.

• The child and youth questionnaire was administered to one randomly selected child or young person in the care of each woman who completed a questionnaire. Where there was no mother or female caregiver in the house (e.g. such as in child headed households), the eldest young person was invited to complete the questionnaire. This questionnaire explored experiences of migration for work; intention to migrate for work; knowledge of other people’s migration experiences; knowledge of child rights, human trafficking, and migration practices; and family well-being.

• A different questionnaire was used in Thailand, in places World Vision works and which are considered ‘host’ or ‘destination’ communities for migrant workers. The questionnaire was administered to one Thai person aged 16 years or older per household, alternating between male and female participants. This questionnaire explored interaction with and attitude towards non-Thai migrant workers; knowledge of non-Thai migrant workers’ rights; and actual and intended behaviours in response to violence and exploitation of non-Thai migrant workers and their children.

Data collection was led by an external consultant in each country.

Information about the number of households in the village, target and actual sample sizes, number of ineligible households approached and number of refusals was used to develop weighting factors for the data. Weighted data was then used for all analysis. Descriptive and bivariate analyses were conducted, using Chi-square test for categorical variables. All of the results of the bivariate analyses presented in this report are statistically significant at the p<0.05 level.
Findings & Considerations

The study included 9,260 people in 98 communities where World Vision currently implements the End Trafficking in Persons (ETIP) program, including 2,885 children, 1,129 youth and 4,014 mothers or female caregivers in vulnerable migration source communities and 1,232 Thai people in migration destination communities.

Table 2: Survey Participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source Community</th>
<th>Cambodia</th>
<th>Laos</th>
<th>Myanmar</th>
<th>Vietnam</th>
<th>Thailand</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Child 12 - 17</td>
<td>634</td>
<td>609</td>
<td>902</td>
<td>740</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>2,885</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youth 18-25</td>
<td>235</td>
<td>267</td>
<td>367</td>
<td>260</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>1,129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mothers / Female Caretakers</td>
<td>869</td>
<td>876</td>
<td>1269</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>4,014</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Destination Community</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Transgender</th>
<th>—</th>
<th>—</th>
<th>—</th>
<th>—</th>
<th>—</th>
<th>—</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>499</td>
<td>726</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>499</td>
<td>726</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Total Participants        | 1738     | 1752   | 2538       | 2000   | 1232   | 9260 |

This report presents a summary of results that are of particular interest to governments, organisations, and agencies working to combat trafficking in the Greater Mekong Subregion.
Migration experience

- Cambodian and Laos children and youth travelled for work (20% and 19%, respectively) more than their counterparts from Myanmar (11%) and Vietnam (9%).

- The majority of children and youth from Cambodia and Laos who migrated for work went to another country (83% and 71%), while child and youth migrants from Vietnam were most likely to travel to another province within their own country (77%) and youth from Myanmar were most likely to travel to another village or town in their home province (60%).

- Among children and youth from Cambodia and Myanmar who migrated for work, approximately half were female and half were male. In contrast, nearly two thirds of Lao youth migrants were female and approximately three quarters of Vietnamese and Myanmar youth migrants were male.

- Similar patterns of decision making about migration were found among child and youth migrants from Cambodia and Myanmar. In these two countries, mothers made the final decision for the child or youth to migrate in approximately half of the cases, while fathers and children or youths themselves made the final decision between one fifth and one quarter of the time. In Vietnam, mothers and fathers were equally likely to make the final decision (approximately 40%) while children and youth made the final decision to migrate in about one fifth of instances. These statistics contrast with Laos, where nearly half of the child and youth migrants surveyed indicated that they themselves made the final decision to migrate. In Laos, fathers and mothers made the final decision to migrate in one quarter and one third of the instances respectively.

- Among child and youth migrants from Cambodia, males (33%) were significantly more likely than females (11%) to make the final decision to migrate for themselves. No gender differences were found in decision making patterns among children and youth from Laos, Myanmar or Vietnam.

- In all four countries, more than 60% of all children and young people who had travelled to another town or country for work were able to find a job that they classified in their own estimation as having ‘good conditions’.

- Most children and young people, especially those from Laos, were able to send money home to their family the last time they migrated for work (82%, 81%, 69%, Vietnam 64%, and Myanmar 54%).

- In all four countries, more than 40% of the participants mentioned at least one negative experience during their migration for work, with children and youth from Laos (70%) reporting the most. Negative experiences included excessive hours of work, debt, withholding wages, assault and dangerous conditions.

Dangerous work, notably in construction, was the most commonly reported negative experience among children and young people across all four countries.

Over 30% of child and youth participants from Cambodia, Lao and Myanmar and more than one quarter from Vietnam, reported that they were ‘Never/seldom free’ to do what they wanted or where they wanted by themselves.

Between one fifth and one third of child and youth migrants and between one third and one half of their female caregivers from all four countries reported that the last time they were away for work they never or seldom had free time to ‘do what they wanted or go where they wanted by themselves’.

- Children and youth: Cambodia 32%; Laos 31%; Myanmar 33%; and Vietnam 22%.

- Mothers: Cambodia 34%; Laos 49%; Myanmar 38%; Vietnam 54%.

A small number of young people (fewer than 5%) from Cambodia, Laos and Myanmar reported physical or sexual abuse while migrating for work, no Vietnamese children reported any violence.

The study found that negative labour migration experiences do not necessarily rule out plans for future migration. Having a negative experience at last migration was not significantly associated with plans not to re-migrate within the next 12 months for any source country.

Policy/programming considerations

- The absence of a significant link between having a bad migration experience and reduced intention to re-migrate highlights that diverse factors influence migration decisions. Those factors that push young people towards migration decisions can outweigh known risks (e.g. being able to send money home may be considered worth enduring dangerous work conditions). Agencies must therefore learn more about the strong drivers behind migration decisions, take these into account and not assume that knowledge of or ‘warnings’ against risks alone, will be effective.

- Given the high prevalence of Cambodian and Laos children and youth migration to another country for work, behaviour change communications (BCC) for these migrants should focus on increasing potentially protective behaviours relevant to intra-country migration (e.g. leaving copies of identity documents at home with family; travelling with family or friends), while for children and youth in Vietnam and Myanmar should focus on messages relevant to intra-country migration, such as understanding recruitment practices particular to that context.
Potentially protective behaviours

- Knowledge of ways to manage one’s identity documents that are potentially protective was high among most children and youth surveyed.
- Most children and youth surveyed knew that children and youth should not give their original identity documents to a recruiter or to an employer to hold. (To an employer – Cambodia 93%, Laos 82%, Myanmar 80% and Vietnam 69%). (To a recruiter – Cambodia 90%, Laos 83%, Myanmar 88% and Vietnam 79%).
- Most knew that when travelling cross border to work, children and youth should have their original identity documents with them (Cambodia 85%, Laos 88%, Myanmar 94% and Vietnam 90%), and except for Cambodian children and youth (37%), most reported that the last time they migrated they did in fact adopt this practice (Laos 61%, Myanmar 57% and Vietnam 83%).
- Most children and youth who had migrated reported that they contacted their family at least weekly (Cambodia 78%; Laos 73%; and Vietnam 89%) however in Myanmar only 38% reported engaging in this potentially protective behaviour.
- Among Cambodian children and youth with migration experience, those who had heard of human trafficking and knew of the risk of being trafficked by an acquaintance, took significantly more actions considered to be potentially protective (e.g., kept copies of their ID documents at home, contacted family weekly or more often, spoke the main language used in the place where they went) than those who were not aware they could be trafficked by someone they knew (72% versus 42%).
- In Cambodia and Laos, a significant association was found among mothers between protective migration behaviours and positive migration experiences. Mothers who practiced four or six protective actions were more likely to have found a job with good conditions, saved a lot of money and sent money home to their family, than mothers who practiced three or fewer potentially protective behaviours (Cambodia, 45% versus 21%; Laos, 44% versus 19%).

Policy/programming considerations

- These findings lend support to the program’s theory of change. They provide examples of higher levels of knowledge about trafficking risk being associated with engagement in a greater number of potentially protective behaviours and in turn, higher use of potentially protective behaviours being associated with higher reports of positive migration experiences.
- BCC6 for children and youth in Cambodia who undertake cross border migration should highlight the importance of contacting with original identity documents at home with family or a trusted person.

Knowledge, attitudes and practices among Thai people living in ‘destination’ communities

Thai citizens were surveyed in Mae Sot and Ranong along the border of Myanmar in Aranyaprathet along the border with Cambodia, and in Mukdahan along the border with Laos.

- Thai citizens surveyed had contact with migrant workers in various ways, most commonly at their place of work. Thai living near the Laos border had much less contact with migrant workers than those living in communities near the border of Cambodia or Myanmar. For example:
  - 50% of Thai in Aranyaprathet – near the Cambodian border – had contact with migrants at work whereas only 13% of Thais in Mukdahan – near the Laos border – had contact with migrants at work.
  - Between one fifth and one third of Thai citizens surveyed reported that they have friends who are migrant workers (Mae Sot 38%, Ranong 30%, Aranyaprathet 34% and Mukdahan 20%).
  - In Mae Sot (Myanmar border) and Aranyaprathet (Cambodia border), 30% and 23% respectively had a migrant domestic worker in their own home.
  - One in seven Thais in (Mae Sot) and one in eight in Mukdahan had contact with migrant workers through marriage (their own or a family member).

- Negative attitudes towards migrant workers were common in Thai destination communities, with more than one third of the Thai community members surveyed reporting that they believed migrants caused at least one of the following: disease, violence, crime, took jobs away from Thai nationals or that migrant children and youth caused crime.

  - The most common negative attitude was that migrants cause more disease in Thailand than Thai citizens, reported by 36% of Thai respondents. One third of Thai citizens believed migrants cause more crime and more violence than Thais and 26% believed migrant children and youth caused more crime than Thai children and youth.
  - In Thai communities on the Myanmar border, most people (Mae Sot 85% and Ranong 80%) held at least one negative belief, near the Cambodian border, more than half (53%) and on the Laos border, just over one third (38%).
  - Most Thai citizens surveyed did not think that migrant workers were unregistered migrants.
  - Almost one quarter (23%) of Thai citizens living close to the Myanmar border reported that they had seen a situation where a local employer had migrant children under 18 years of age working in dangerous conditions. Nearly one in ten Thai living near the Laos or Cambodia border reported the same (9% and 9% respectively). Among all Thai citizens who had witnessed children or youth working in dangerous conditions for a local employer, just 10% had reported it or spoken to someone who might assist the child or youth.

- In the Thai communities bordering Myanmar and Cambodia, approximately one fifth of Thai citizens surveyed knew of an employer forcing migrants to work more than 12 hours per day and more than six days per week (Myanmar, Mae Sot 20% and Ranong 21%; Cambodia 23%). In the community bordering Laos, only 8% reported this. Among all those who had witnessed workers exploited in this way, just 9% had reported it or spoken to someone who might assist the migrant workers.

One fifth of Thai citizens surveyed knew of an employer forcing migrants to work too many hours and days and almost a quarter reported seeing situations of a migrant child or youth working in dangerous conditions, on the Myanmar border.

- Up to one fifth of Thai citizens surveyed who lived near the Myanmar border reported that they had witnessed an employer in their community hit or beat a migrant worker (Mae Sot 16% and Ranong 21%). Physical violence had reportedly been witnessed by 13% of Thai living near the Laos border and 7% of Thai living near the Cambodian border. Among Thai who had observed such violence, fewer than half (44%) said they reported it to someone such as police, a community leader or an NGO.

- An association was found between attitudes of Thai citizens towards migrant workers and reporting behaviour, with 58% of Thai citizens who did not have negative beliefs about migrant workers reporting violence they had observed to someone who could help, compared with 40% of Thai who held at least one negative belief (e.g., that migrant workers cause disease and crime more than Thai citizens.

- Large differences were found among Thai citizens’ attitudes towards government assistance to registered migrants compared with unregistered migrants.
  - Most (87%) Thai community members surveyed thought that a registered migrant worker who was exploited (e.g., forced to work, or tricked into a job, prostitution or other dangerous activities) should have the right to assistance from the Thai government, but only approximately half (54%) thought that unregistered migrants should have this right.
  - Most Thai citizens surveyed did not think that migrant workers and their families should receive the same level of assistance from the Thai government as Thai workers and their families. Support for assistance to registered migrants and their families was low (32%) and even lower for unregistered migrants and their families (11%).
Policy/programming considerations

- BCC to foster positive attitudes and overcome negative attitudes towards migrant workers are required in all ETIP destination communities in Thailand, but especially those bordering Myanmar. BCC preparation work should investigate reasons behind negative beliefs about migrants, especially the widely-held belief that they cause diseases and learnings which we can share with interested stakeholders and actors.
- BCC to encourage and promote reporting of suspected exploitation of migrant workers to appropriate persons/agencies who can assist workers. Some of the reticence with regard to reporting to date will be connected to poor attitudes towards migrant workers, however other contributing factors need to be investigated to inform effective BCC (e.g., capacity of police to follow-up on/investigate reported exploitation, fear of personal consequences from reporting, etc.).
- Promotes work and travel registration, including obtaining necessary official documents, to potential migrants to Thailand.

Innovation in measuring efforts to reduce vulnerability

Measuring success in combating trafficking is very challenging. As part of the ETIP program, World Vision is taking an innovative approach to quantifying its impact on vulnerable populations drawing on the data gathered in this study. Data collected about factors that may contribute to a child or youth’s vulnerability, or which might be protective, is being used to inform the further refinement of the program, as well as inform the monitoring of progress against assigned targets. Further, it has assisted the ETIP team to develop an innovative ‘risk of trafficking score’ for children and youth. The predictive value of this score will be tested based on information collected from survivors of trafficking. In the future, the risk score may be used to guide the interventions of projects that aim to prevent human trafficking as well as to help measure their effectiveness.

An evaluation at the conclusion of the ETIP project will evaluate the influences of our project in reducing risk of trafficking vulnerability in the target locations, and in improving the attitudes and behaviours among host/destination communities.

Next Steps

Future exploration

World Vision is looking for opportunities to learn more about how to combat human trafficking. The data included in this report is a selection of key findings based on the analysis to date. The findings of this study point to numerous areas for further exploration, such as:

- Detailed multivariate analysis of the ETIP study data, to explore underlying predictors or determinants of vulnerability to, and opportunities for, prevention of trafficking.
- Qualitative investigation of migration attitudes and willingness to re-migrate even after a very negative migration experience, particularly among children and youth, and further investigate into the factors that contribute to a decision to migrate for work.
- Qualitative interviews with migrant children and youth in destination locations to gain a deeper understanding of their motivations and experiences.
- Further investigation of whether migration practices that have been suggested to be protective do actually reduce vulnerability to or risk of trafficking.
- Further investigation into the actual work conditions migrants experience and exploration of migrant views of acceptable/“good” conditions or unacceptable/“bad” conditions and how this affects their decision making.

World Vision hopes that further analysis may provide additional insights and learnings which we can share with interested stakeholders and actors combating human trafficking in the region and abroad.

Glossary & Working Definition of Terms

Behaviour Change

Communication (BCC)

A consultative process for addressing an individual’s knowledge, attitudes and practices, linked to program goals. Participants are provided with information and motivation through communication and participatory methods.

Child rights

The United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child sets out the basic rights of children and the obligations of duty bearers to fulfil these rights.

Destination (or host) community refers to the people living in the destination to which migrants are travelling. Generally, destination communities are more developed than source communities.

End Trafficking in Persons Program (ETIP)

A project led by World Vision and implementing partners that aim to prevent trafficking, protect and empower trafficking survivors and bring about policy and system change.

GMS

Greater Mekong Sub-region (Cambodia, China, Laos, Myanmar, Thailand, Vietnam)

Host community

See Destination community.

Human rights

Basic entitlements that belong to everyone, and the obligations of duty bearers to fulfil these rights.

The United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC) is a legal instrument which defines the rights of the child and sets the obligations of duty bearers to ensure those rights are protected, fulfilled and respected.

Human trafficking

Involves putting or keeping someone in an exploitative situation involving, for example: forced or debt-bonded labour, child labour, sexual exploitation, domestic servitude, armed conflict, usually for profit.

Human trafficking risk

Risk factors that contribute to a person’s vulnerability to being trafficked.

Proactive migration action/behaviours

Measures an individual takes to protect themselves while travelling.

Registered migrant

A person who migrates through official channels with appropriate necessary documents.

Risk migration action/behaviours

Behaviours that put an individual at risk of human trafficking while travelling.

Source community

Where a migrant lives before he/she migrates; certain locations have been identified (by survivors of human trafficking and agencies supporting them) as places from which numerous migrants who find themselves in trafficking situations originate.

Theory of Change

An explanation of how change occurs. A Theory of Change specifies long-term goals and the necessary pre-conditions and maps their causal linkages. It also makes explicit the assumptions (often otherwise implicit) about how and why change is expected. In this way, Theory of Change is both a process and a product that is valuable at both the design and evaluation stage of an initiative.

Unregistered migrant

A person who migrates without necessary official documents.
This report presents an overview of the findings of an extensive regional study conducted by World Vision in communities in Cambodia, Laos, Myanmar, Thailand, and Vietnam on knowledge, attitudes and practices related to trafficking in persons, with a specific focus on the vulnerability of migrant populations.

The study was undertaken to inform the further refinement, monitoring and evaluation of World Vision’s “End Trafficking in Persons” (ETIP) program, a regional initiative designed to prevent and respond to trafficking in persons in the Greater-Mekong Subregion.